

Kare Dergi

International academic journal on comparative literary, cultural, linguistics, and folklore studies.

ISSN: 2536-4596, Kayseri / Turkey

Volume 1, Issue 2, p. 15-29

www.karedergi.net

TRAGEDY IN TESS OF THE D'UBERVILLES AND YAPRAK DÖKÜMÜ¹

Hasan BAKTIR², Eda Kevser ŞAHİN³

ABSTRACT

Drama is a representation of man in action. Tragedy, as a form of drama, is the representation of a noble man, noble action and noble diction. However, concept of tragedy changes in a process of time. Shakespeare makes innovation mixing tragedy and comedy. Representation of tragic lives of the middle class is popularized by Thomas Hardy during the 19th century. Arthur Miller argues that modern tragedy should deal with the problems of common men rather than noble people. The idea of tragedy and reflection of tragic lives of common people are embodied by novelists. This paper compares tragic lives of two characters in two different novels. Tess in Thomas Hardy's Tess of the D'Urbervilles and Ali Rıza Bey in Y. Nuri Güntekin's Yaprak Dökümü will be compared to find out similar tragic elements.

Keywords: Tragedy, Darwinism, Tragic, Thomas Hardy, Y. Nuri Güntekin.

Introduction

This paper investigates the idea of tragic and tragedy in Tess of the D'Urbervilles by Thomas Hardy (British) and Yaprak Dökümü by Reşat Nuri Güntekin (Turkish). The first part of the paper excavates certain tragic elements in Tess of the D'Urbervilleles wheares the second part of the paper deal with the tragedy of Ali Rıza Bey in Yaprak Dökümü. Lastly, the tragic aspects of the two novels will be compared in terms of similarities and differences.

¹ This paper is presented in the 2nd International Comparative Literature Conference between 6th and 8th of September at Sakarya University, Turkey.

² Assoc. Prof. Dr., English Language and Literature Department, Erciyes University, Turkey.

³ Res. Assistant, English Language and Literature Department, Erciyes University, Turkey.

Kare Dergi

International academic journal on comparative literary, cultural, linguistics, and folklore studies.

Volume 1/2

Tragedy as a dramatic representation deals with a serious and important event, which eventually causes a disaster for the protagonist. The hero in the tragedy is neither wholly good nor evil, but eventually makes a mortal error (hamartia) that prepares his tragic end. There are uncertainties, strange and painful events and shattering of the world (Abrams, 212-13). At the end of the play, after the hero dies, there is reconciliation, and the order is reoriented. During the antiquity, the Middle Ages and Renaissance, tragedy is a dramatic form, which represents the lives of the noble men. In contemporary societies, regarding the notion of the individual and society, the concept of tragedy has undergone various changes; there is a shift from the classical idea of tragedy as 'inevitable and beyond the human control' to the modern idea of a tragedy as 'something humanly engineered and happening in a world in which something could and should be done'. In addition, modern tragedies are about ordinary people rather than kings and queens and display how far the lives of such people are bound up, determined and constrained by broader social, economic and political realities (Bennet and Boyle, 106-7). It is novels in modern society that work with tragedy to represent social, personal, economic and political controversies of modern men and there are many sorts of novels that show obvious conformities with the model that are peculiar to tragedy. Hardy's *Tess of the D'Uberilles* and Reşat Nuri Güntekin's *Yaprak Dökümü* are examples of tragedy in fiction. The present paper deals with the concept of tragedy in these two-fictitious works.

I. Tragic End of Tess

Tess of the D'Uberilles is a novel about Tess. Hardy depicts her life from the time when she is sixteen or seventeen to the age of twenty-one, and the story of Tess in the novel is divided into seven phases. She begins each phase of her life with an altered view of herself and her destiny. At the end of each phase, Tess reaches a juncture in her life; circumstances she comes across changes her life so that she will be different henceforth. She sees her future as a "long and stony highway, which she must tread, without aid, and with little sympathy." She is seduced by Alec, after whom her life becomes tragic. The author contrasts Tess's personality before and after the seduction; leaving Trantridge, she is no longer the simple girl who arrived four months ago and her view of life has totally changed. The author also intensifies his portrait of her as innocent by emphasizing that Tess has broken a social law, not a natural one, and that most of her distress is caused by her fear of 'moral hobgoblins'.

In *Tess of D'Uberilles* plot, setting, narration, characters and events are carefully selected to contribute to the tragic atmosphere of the novel.

Firstly, the story of Tess begins 'on the evening in the later part of May', time when her father learns that he has noble ancestors; which marks the beginning of Tess's tragedy, and makes her victim. Setting is also tragic; Blackmoor is a 'fertile and sheltered tract of country, in which the fields are never brown and the spring never dry'. It is an isolated area, which differs sharply from the country beyond the encircling hills. "Here, in the valley the world seems to be constructed upon a smaller and more delicate scale." Immediately describing the town as a small, sheltered and isolated place at the beginning of the chapter 1, and by presenting Tess and her friends dancing, the reader is made aware that henceforth things will be tragic. Old Lady-day presents a symbolic tragic scene, after which Tess participates Alec.

In Tess of the D'Urbervilles nature plays a role, contributing to the tragedy of the heroine. Apart from the description of towns and scenes as tragic, all changes in her life coincide with the advancing season; every change in their relationship proceeds naturally from some casual incident in the life of the dairy. As Tess's plight grows more tragic, 'the weather turns bitterer, and the lush, fertile valleys are left behind for the starve-acre land of Flintcomb-Ash; the evening sun was now ugly to her, like a great inflamed wound in the sky' (quoted in Carey, 56-61). Tess is ready to begin her confession; 'the fire lighted the ashes, under the grate, vertically, like a torrid waste; when she finishes her confession the fire in the grate looks ironically funny, as if it did not care in the least about her strait; the fender grinned idly, as if it too did not care and the light from the water bottle was merely engaged in a chromatic problem' (Carey, 56-61). All material objects around her contribute to and announce her tragic fate.

In addition, Hardy also portrays Tess as a simple country maiden who is protected from the dangers of the world beyond. For instance, the first picture of Tess is a pretty, shy, modest and innocent country girl, who is poor, naïve, and innocent in a harsh, fertile and deserted Blackmoor. Her pride and family loyalty are also important qualities, which lead to her tragedy. Symbolically, we are prepared to the victimization of Tess through the depiction of Blackmoor and Tess's simple and poor character. In such a description there is an implication that not only nature but also Tess's heredity works together for the preparation of tragedy in the novel.

Tess of the D'Urbervilles can also be considered as a social tragedy in the sense that there is an immediate insistence in the novel on the influence of the new and wealthy merchant class upon the lives of the rural folk. It is the bitter reality of modern society that the rich have control upon the lives of the poor. Capitalism is the economic system in the contemporary society, and those who have money, have power.

In the novel there is a reference to the current state of the society. In the new society 'the old order changeth', and 'the little finger of the sham d'Uberville can do more for Tess than the whole dynasty of real underneath' since in the new order relationships are determined by money only' and d'Uberilles have money (Sewall, 124-29). The Industrial Revolution is in the process of destroying the agricultural life, and the subsequent shifting of population causes the disintegration of rural customs and traditions. It is a period when fundamental beliefs –religious, social, and political- are shaken to their very core (Carey, 7). Thus, Tess's tragedy is also linked up with a new and wealthy but morally corruptive merchant. Alec is a stock-in-trade figure from new, wealthy and immoral class, and he introduces himself as 'the old Other One who can tempt in the disguise of an inferior animal' (p.369).

Alec is from the new and merciless merchant class who has power but no mercy. Tess, on the other hand, is from poor and rural class of the society and she faces difficulties in adapting to new and merciless circumstances of the contemporary society. In the novel, for instance, Tess is often compared to a "bird caught in a trap," and by the repeated use of this metaphor, the author almost justifies her heroine for her sin against society. In addition, Tess, in the story is placed in the half-primitive Blackmoor, where she must learn to cope with all sorts of difficulties. Tess, in a process of time and because of some bitter experiences, learns to cope with the fierce environment; at the beginning she 'was a mere vessel of emotion untinged by experience ... phases of her childhood lurked in her aspect still. As she walked along to-day, [...] you could see her twelfth year in her cheeks, or her ninth sparkling from her eyes' (p.13). The instinct to adapt herself to the natural environment is stronger than her ability to cope with fierce social circumstances in Tess, therefore, she could struggle against the hostile and unknown forces and able to adapt to the new and different surroundings. However, she cannot adapt herself to the new society as much as she does to nature and the environment.

She sees the difficulties of life in Talbothays and Flint-comb Ash. Her father's death and their misery afterwards teach Tess that a woman like her is inevitably a victim of the society. After she learns the fact that people around her, especially those who seem to love her, have no mercy 'she is not altogether full of hope but full of conviction that a crisis in her life is approaching', since 'once victim is always victim, that is law' (p, 384). She is no longer as sensuous as she was before, and now she sees that Angel has no right to desert her in despair, and she is convicted to live with Alec. However, when she learns that Angel is back, she kills Alec and gets rid of her everlasting pains. Death, then, is no longer painful to Tess; therefore, she does not run away.

She is now aware that society and nature have combined forces against her, and “Justice” was done and, the president of the Immortals, in Aeschylean phrase, had ended his sport with Tess (p. 508). But her struggle against these almost insurmountable odds brings respect for her courage.

Tess is born in one type of environment, and these environmental forces govern basic actions in her life. She takes her sensuousness, love, hate and sexual attraction from nature: her ‘flower-red-mouth, pretty face, fine figure and affinity with nature from her ancestors, and the sense of responsibility, poverty and vulnerable spirit from society. These forces together determine her psychology. She feels responsible for her family; therefore, she accepts to go to the d’Uberilles and asks for help. She also feels responsible when the horse, Prince, dies. Similarly, she accepts to live with Alec in the end to save her mother, sister and brother. Likewise, because of her fine and delicate spirit she is not able to confess at once, and her attractive psychical appearance victimizes her. She can do nothing for herself; therefore, she is at the mercy of forces outside her own self. Consequently, her family, Alec, nature, and Angel mould Tess, and they all together drastically continue to function in Tess’s life to victimize her (Sewall, 124-33).

It is also, to some extent, her pride, her passionate nature, her passivity and other combinations of similar features and psychological qualities that determine her tragic end. That is, ‘a slight incautiousness of character inherited from her race’, her pride, which is thought to be ‘a symptom of that reckless acquiescence, in chance too apparent in whole d’Uberilles family’ (XIV: p.114); and the stress of words such as ‘doomed’, ‘destined’ and ‘fated’ are crucial links to her inevitable tragedy in the novel:

She might as well have agreed first that the appetite for joy, which pervades all creation, that tremendous force which sways humanity to its purpose, as the tides sways the helpless weed, was not to be controlled by vague lucubration over the social rubric (p. 244).

In this sense, the inevitability of the heroine’s tragic fate is not to be found in various forms of determinism alluded to in the novel, but in the psychological nature of existence that she is imagined possessing. Therefore, her tragedy is partly related to the psychological considerations of other characters like Angel and Alec, and partly to the society. Angel, for instance, is in love with the image of his own making; the image of Tess is one of the rustic innocence and virgin purity for Angel.

He thinks that Tess is 'a fresh and virginal daughter of Nature' (Waldoff (135-37). He has in mind a prior and idealized image that Tess appears to match. He is obsessed with purity, therefore, when Tess confesses, he says that the 'woman he loves is not Tess but a woman in her image'. Alec's obsession with Tess's physical attraction is related to his psychological nature. He loves 'beauty', 'the flower-red-mouth' and 'the pretty face', not poor, passionate and sensuous Tess; therefore, he addresses Tess as 'my beauty'. Then, the conflicts in the novel between Tess and Alec, and Tess and Angel are related to psychological feelings and sexual and intellectual considerations. When considered from such respect, Tess's tragedy is a result of the fierce psychological attitudes of Alec and Angel. Sewall states:

This is a true tragedy of Tess of d'Uberfield – not a girl's loss of virginity, or even a woman's murder of a man when goaded past endurance ... Tess was not only victim of fate, circumstance, a malign progenitor, of shiftless, cowardly, or bestial people, she was also victim of her own sensuality and of insidious need to immolate herself under the deceptive guise of benefiting others (125-6).

Fateful incidents, overheard conversations, and undelivered letters, psychological consideration, nature, social codes seem to work together in the novel to determine Tess's tragedy and her own destiny. Many examples of the fateful incident may be found in Tess: Tess's misfortune to be born fits into a shiftless family: Durbeyfield's learning of his lineage, the death of the horse, the events which frustrate Tess's attempt to confess to Angel, ending in her letter, slipping beneath the carpet, the death of her father, and the return of Angel just too late. One has the impression, then, this is a book to illuminate the tragedy of a poor girl.

II. Tragedy of Ali Rıza Bey

Yaprak Dökümü is a social novel about Ali Rıza Bey, an official. He first works for the government then begins to work in the company whose owner is his former student. He has to give up his job and retire just after he finds out about the illegitimate relationship between the owner of the company and the girl who is given a position in the company with the help of Ali Rıza Bey. The tragedy of Ali Rıza Bey in the novel begins just after he decides to retire. His son Şevket maintains the family after the retirement of Ali Rıza Bey. However, his salary is not enough for the family. Especially after Şevket gets married there is squandering, which leads to corruption and tragedy in the family. Daughters, their mother and the daughter-in-law are all squandering.

Ali Rıza Bey is in misery, Şevket is imprisoned, and Necla marries to an Arab, Leyla becomes the mistress of a lawyer, Fikret makes an unhappy marriage. Each stage that marks the beginning of the troubles in the family is represented with the fall of the leaves.

In *Yaprak Dökümü*, Güntekin narrates the bitter catastrophe of the old-fashioned individual and his inevitable tragedy in the community in which painful changes take place. There is a conflict in *Yaprak Dökümü* and the present conflict in the novel arises between the opposing environments; on one hand Ali Rıza Bey, is a traditional man and is strongly equipped with moral values. The community, on the other hand, is on the verge of the changes and illuminated by the new and modern life style. Ali Rıza Bey is dismissed from his occupation in Trabzon since he attempted to punish the son of a powerful and wealthy landlord, who abducted the wife of a villager:

Koca arkasız bir çiftçi; öteki bütün kasaba halkının tuttuğu bir eşraf oğlu idi. Onu için asıl kabahatlinin kollarını sallaya sallaya ortada dolaşmasına göz yummak ve namusuna kastedilen adamı –göğsündeki yaralarıyla hapse atmak lazım geldi. Etliye sütlüye karışmamayı öteden beri meslek edinen Ali Rıza Bey, bu meselede ateş kesilmiş, kendini atırcıya kadar uğraşmıştı (p. 15).

He returns to Istanbul and begins to work as a translator in the company where he has an unfortunate experience. He helps a girl to get a position in the company, but later she has an affair with the owner and gets pregnant. Ali Rıza Bey feels responsible and decides to talk to Muzaffer Bey, the owner of the company. In the end he understands this and admits:

... bir an içinde anladı ki karşısındaki insan, senelerden beri yaptığı hayalden büsbütün başka insandır; şimdiye kadar gördüğü güzel muamele, sırf zararsız, terbiyeli bir ihtiyar addedilmesinden ileri gelmiştir (p.21).

Feeling responsible, he leaves the company and decides to retire. After his retirement there appears an operating force in the novel that constitutes serious, painful and destructive events, which lead the course of life to tragedy for poor Ali Rıza Bey. First, he begins to attend a coffeehouse where all the retired people go to kill time, then; he begins to wear old-fashioned clothing. He loses control over his family; his wife and daughters ignore him.

It is obvious that only when he is economically powerful, he has the power to control the family and a place in the community. Whenever he is economically weak he is one of those bystanders who spend most of their time in the coffeehouse.

The present conflict between Ali Rıza Bey and his contemporary society in the novel presents the impact of circumstances upon human life. Environment, society and the psychology of the protagonist together lead to tragedy. In such circumstances man becomes inevitably the victim and tool of forces that are beyond his control. In *Yaprak Dökümü* there are two environments; one is the community in which Ali Rıza Bey lives and the other is his family. He cannot adapt to the community in which people do not have moral values. Ali Rıza Bey believes that 'he is an old-fashioned man who believes that man can be happy even if he does not have money' (p.11). People, in the community, however, think that economic situation and wealth are important to be happy. This is apparent on the pages 7-8 where one of Ali Rıza Bey's colleagues discusses his view:

Eğlenmeye avuç dolusu para harcamaya giden insanları tanıyorum [...] kendi kendime sorarım "bunların hepsi benden değerli insanlar mı? Onlar böyle alabildiklerine yaşayıp giderken ben niçin köpekler gibi sokaklarda sürüneyim? İstediyimi yiyip giymeyeyim? [...] böyle yıllarca kendi kendime çekiştikten sonar şu neticede karar kıldım. "Babam fazla namuslu bir adammış [...]" "Bir adamın çocuklarına bırakacağı en kıymetli miras temiz bir isimmiş dermiş" [...] fakat etrafımızdaki zenginlerin hepsi koltuklarında çek defterleri ile analarından çıkmadılar ya. [...] sen de talihini tecrübe et.

Ali Rıza Bey is not interested in how to earn money. He thinks that morality is the most important value. However, he has neither money nor the power to resist the corruption in the contemporary society. He leaves his job because he feels responsible and his life becomes miserable. Muzaffer, though committing adultery, is still a respectable and powerful man, because he has money. Similarly, the girl who has an affair with Muzaffer Bey does it to get some benefit from his wealth. Then, the present conflicts and contradictions between Ali Rıza Bey and people around him lead to frailty and tragedy of Ali Rıza Bey.

In addition, he cannot cope with the family affairs as with his family, there is a similar contradiction. He treats his family and children in a traditional way. When they begin to interact with the contemporary community –especially after Ferhunde, his daughter-in-law, arrives- things and reality in the family and in the contemporary society begins to clash.

Therefore, his wife and children are first to cry out and leave him alone (p.46). There is no happiness, order and revelation in the family as stated by Ali Rıza Bey:

“Evin adı artık cehennem olmuştu ... Bu gidişle sonları ne olacaktı?.. Ev delik deşik bir gemi gibi günden güne batıyordu” (49-50).

Ali Rıza Bey becomes not only the victim of the contemporary society but also of his moral values and psychological considerations. It is his moral and psychological decisions that make him responsible for his fate; it is his pride, his insistence on moral values, his passivity and some other forces that work for him to lead such a painful and miserable end. He is aware of social and moral code, but he is not aware of the fact that traditional values do not work and provide happiness in modern society.

The social code, the psychological inclinations and the moral consideration of Ali Rıza Bey then, can be considered as reasons for the tragedy of Ali Rıza Bey. The gap between the generations and the concept of westernization may also be other reasons that contribute to the tragic atmosphere of the novel. On one hand, there are traditional values, a traditional life-style and a traditional family; on the other hand, there is a new, western life-style, western morality and family. Güntekin narrates the gap between two separate classes and compares the lack of communication between generations. He also depicts the degeneration of morality and family together with a new and western life-style.

In a sense, the concepts of west and modernity have always been problematic in the history of Turkish reformation. It is commonly argued that there is misapprehension and wrong application. People accept the western life-style as a complete form of modernity and do not take culture, equality, liberty, freedom, justice and scientific innovation into consideration. As a result, there appears a group of elite with a western life-style, who do not have any awareness of justice, equality and freedom. There are large numbers of people who do not have money but who want to be modern and live like wealthy people. Such a conflict is apparent in Ali Rıza Bey's family; they are poor and sometimes they do not have food to eat, but when there is a party they forget their misery:

Sefalet son dereceyi bulmaya başlamıştı. Bazen evde ateş yanmadığı, tencere kaynamadığı gün oluyordu. [...] herkes eline geçirdiği zeytin, peynir, pastırmayla bir köşede karnını doyuruyor, pek soğuk havalarda kapsız yorganlara sarılıyordu...

Böyle olmakla beraber davet günleri geldiğinde yine herşey değişiyordu. Bütün ev halkı barış görüş oluyor ; yüzler gülüyor, elbirliğiyle bir çalışma başlıyordu... Ali Rıza Bey'in anlayamadığı şeyleden biri de acı ve sefalet içinde kıvranan ve birbirlerini yiyen bu insanların eğlence saati gelince birdenbire herşeyi unutmaları, hiçbirşey olmamış gibi eğlenmeye başlamalarıydı (p. 70)

Ali Rıza Bey is a traditional man, but his family and the majority of people in the community have a new and modern way of living. Then, there arises a lack of communication and an inevitable conflict between them. In the novel the tragic end of Ali Rıza Bey is prepared by bringing together the opposite worlds, opposite characters and inevitable forces. Yaprak Dökümü, then, is a novel and tragedy in the sense that, like Tess of the D'Ubervilles, society, external forces and psychological features of the protagonist lead to tragedy. Although there is no death in the end there arises a feeling of pity on the part of the readers. The novel with all these peculiarities may be considered as a social tragedy.

III. Comparison of Tess and Ali Rıza Bey

We shall consider the question of the tragic in its modern and contemporary form. There are many sorts of literary works that are tragedies of some kind and often show obvious conformities with the earlier model. It is also evident that tragedy has undergone certain changes during the past centuries. In the secular and modern tragedy as exemplified in the novels, the social order, the political system and the psychology of the protagonist determine man and his destiny. This is apparent both in Tess of the D'Ubervilles and in Yaprak Dökümü. Tess, for instance, is a simple country maiden who is innocent of the dangers of the world beyond. The first picture of Tess is 'pretty and innocent girl who is shy, modest, proud'. In addition, she is loyal to and 'feels responsible for her family'. However, such characteristics of Tess, which are partly determined by Nature and heredity and partly by the social code, together, lead to her tragedy (Carey, 62-4). Ali Rıza Bey, on the other hand, as long as he works, is protected from the dangers of the cruel and the immoral social forces. He confesses that he is an old man who believes that man can be happy even if he does not have money (p.11). He does not consider the changes that take place in his contemporary society. In addition, he is weak and passive in personality, and he does not have much control over his family. Therefore, the social degeneration, his personality and his family lead to the tragedy of Ali Rıza Bey. Then, like in Tess of the D'Ubervilles, social and personal forces operate to determine for Ali Rıza Bey. They are remarkably close to the sort of model of modern tragedy written in novel form. There

is no God or divine order or ultimate justice, nor ironic revelation in both novels. Natural causes, psychological weakness of the protagonist, and society determine the tragedy of the person.

The transformation in the concept of tragedy in both novels is due to the changes regarding the notion of individual and society. Traditional tragedies are about a noble man and his tragic failure. Modern tragedy is about ordinary man and shows how far the lives of ordinary people are bound up, determined and constrained by broader social order, economic and political realities. In modern tragedy there is a fundamental shift from classical idea of tragedy as inevitable and beyond human control to the modern idea of a tragedy as something humanly engineered and happening in a world in which something should be and could be done about inequality (Bennet, 107). *Tess of the D'Ubervilles* and *Yaprak Dökümü* are tragedy in modern sense. Firstly, both novels are about ordinary people, even people from lower-middle class. Tess is a daughter of a villager, Ali Rıza Bey is an official and they are both poor. We are encountered by a broader social order, economic and philosophical realities which constrain and bind up Tess and Ali Rıza Bey. *Tess of the D'Ubervilles* portrays the picture of Victorian society in which the Industrial Revolution is in the process of destroying the agricultural life, and the subsequent shifting of wealth from aristocracy to a new merchant class causes the disintegration of rural customs and tradition. It is a period of fundamental changes in religious belief, political, economic and social reality. Religion does not satisfy human soul and emotion, and people find it difficult in such circumstances to believe and rely on certainty. It is apparent in the novel; Angel's family is religious; therefore, they have a limited worldview. Alec is from the new wealthy merchant class without moral or social values; he can be a seducer and corrupter and at the same time can convert. Poor Tess does not have much chance to be happy in such a society.

Yaprak Dökümü is about a particular period similar to the Victorian Era to some extent. The events most probably take place during the Tanzimat. It is a period in which there is a clash between modern and traditional forces. Old values and traditional life style, beliefs and family structure begin to change. Old and traditional life style and belief do not provide happiness for the society. They no longer belong and operate in social life. There is a disintegration of the family and a gap between the generations. The state of modernism is a new and powerful force that shapes society and lives of people. Ali Rıza Bey is from the traditional class and cannot adapt to the new and modern life style. He cannot think and live like a modern man since; his moral values and social reality are from the past century. His family is in love with the modern life style, dances and parties. Muzaffer, Ferhunde, Necla and many other characters in the novel are modern. Only Fikret, Şevket and Ali Rıza Bey are traditional. In the end, modern characters are rewarded with wealth, and the lives of traditional characters –who are morally well of become tragic.

The psychological features of both Ali Rıza Bey and Tess are another reason for their tragic end. Throughout the two novels, Tess and Ali Rıza Bey are presented as victims of their own sensualities. When we consider Tess with particular attention to the conditions that determine the course of love and marriage, it is clear that her fate is, to a large extent, the result of her psychological attitude. The psychological condition of her imaginary world is as harsh and punishing as the physical condition of Flintcomb-Ash or Edgon Heath (Waldoff, 150). She is not able to develop reasonable ideas about a man. For instance; she 'hates Alec because he is seductive, and he is not more than dust and ashes for her' (p. 104). Her affection for Angel, on the other hand, is the 'breath and life for and it enveloped her as a photosphere, irradiated her into forgetfulness of her past sorrows' (p. 249). In addition, Alec and Angel have two opposite images of love. Alec sees Tess as a sexual object; the other sees her as an idealized pastoral image of purity. She has no existence, an experience, a passion a structure of sensation to anybody but to herself. Tess does not have any belief about God and religion. She learns reality and truth by experience in the world, which is injustice.

Ali Rıza Bey, like Tess, has psychological weaknesses and sentimental attitudes towards the society. He has a strong sense of morality and justice and believes that what he does is fair and right. He is angry with people like Muzaffer and people in the coffeehouse since they are morally weak. On one hand, he feels responsible for his family but, on the other hand, he thinks that moral principles are more important. He feels unhappy because that 'he is going to leave but because his children will be miserable' (p.24). His psychological attitude and moral principle cause a disaster as stated by her wife Hayriye Hanım:

Darılma Ali Rıza bey... Kalbimde ne varsa söyleyeceğim. Sen çocuklarının menfaatini daima vehimlere feda ettin. (p. 34). Bir doğruluktur tuturdun, bizi hiç düşünmedin. Dilenci çocuklarından beter ettin. Herkes çocuklarının bir dediğini iki etmezken, [...] bizi hizmetçi gibi ezdirmeye nasıl razı olacaksın (p. 60)

His wife thinks that Ali Rıza Bey's sentimentality and moral inclination are illusions, which not only destroy the family but also Ali Rıza Bey. Due to the psychological and moral conditions, Ali Rıza Bey becomes miserable; he leaves home and goes to live with his oldest daughter, Fikret. However, she is not happy with her husband and Ali Rıza Bey involuntarily leaves. He has no place to go and no home to live. In the end Ali Rıza Bey accepts to live with his daughter, Leyla who is a mistress of a lawyer. He is happy at home but whenever he goes out and sees some of his friends he bows his head (p.134).

In both novels, painful changes that take place in the society are important for the preparation of tragedy. Tess is often compared to a “bird caught in a trap,” and by the repeated use of this metaphor, the author portrays his heroine almost without blame for her sin against society. Tess, in the story, is placed in the half-primitive Blackmoor, where she must learn to cope with all sorts of difficult conditions if she is to survive. In a process of time and as a result of long period of experience Tess learns to cope with the fierce environment. In the beginning, Tess ‘was a mere vessel of emotion untinged by experience ... phases of her childhood lurked in her aspect still. As she walked along to-day, [...] you could see her twelfth year in her cheeks, or her ninth sparkling from her eyes’ (p.13). She is very naïve when she begins to work for d’Urbervilles; after Alec seduces her, she learns that society is hostile and destructive. She experiences the difficulties of life in Talbothays and Flint-comb Ash. Especially, her father’s death and their misery afterwards teach Tess that woman like her is an inevitable victim of society, since ‘once victim is always victim, that is law’. She is no longer as sensuous as he is before and now she sees that Angel is no right to desert her in despair. Society and nature have combined forces against her, and “Justice” has been done and, the president of the Immortals, in Aeschylean phrase, had ended his sport with Tess (p. 508). She becomes the victim of society more than her psychological conditions and natural environment.

In the case of Ali Rıza Bey, the circumstances are different, but there is a similarly like the hostile and destructive society. In the opening lines of the novel a young man argues ‘one’s fate is not determined by divine order; therefore, one can earn money if he tries his chance’ (P.7). Ali Rıza Bey, on the other hand, admits that he is an old man who believes that there are other things than money that can give man happiness, ‘he believes this and he is ready to die with this’ (p.11). In a process of time and after painful experiences he learns the reality. He is often reminded that ‘kendi düşen ağlamaz’ (p. 40). He is respectable in the family as long as he is economically well off and can afford the money for the family. But when he is not able to provide money for the family, he is not considered to be someone deserving respect (p.82). Şevket admits that one has right to love and to be happy if one has money (p. 104). There is a struggle between Necla and Leyla for the same man, who is rich. As a result, each member of family falls like leaves (p. 118). When Ali Rıza Bey learns that Leyla becomes the mistress of lawyer, he is terribly disappointed:

O geceden sonra çenesi biraz daha yana çarpıldı. Dili belli belirsiz petekleşti. Yürürken sol ayağını hafifçe sürümeye başladı. Fakat kendisi bunun farkında görünmüyordu. Onu yiyip bitiren asıl hastalık içinde idi (p. 123).

He loses his children one by one; each case is represented as the fall of leaves. In the end he is destined to accept the most painful and unendurable fact. He has no chance to live but with Leyla.

Conclusion

That 'one is victim, always victim' in Tess of the d'Uberilles and 'ne yapalım kendi düşen ağlamaz' in Yaprak Dökümü are similarly experimented as subject matters. In both novels we encounter social tragedy. The tragedy of Tess and Ali Rıza Bey are partly related to social and natural circumstances, partly to their psychological attitudes and partly to changes that take place in society. However, in both novels there arises a question about society, religion, morals and the contrast between good life and its reward. Good people are punished, and evil ones are rewarded. It may also be a message of two novels that in such corruptive society and in such an injustice world for the weak and the poor, tragedy is an inevitable end. It may also be considered that humankind creates mystery, uncertainty and strangeness of the world and painful circumstances. Thus, man creates his own tragedy and his own fate.

There is also catharsis and reconciliation in both novels. In tragedy catharsis arises because of sympathy with a character, and sympathy is indistinguishable from identification with that character and experiencing and suffering with her or him. Through catharsis there is a cleansing of emotions and one gets rid of painful and selfish feelings. In the case of Tess and Ali Rıza Bey, the reader feels sad and unhappy for the pure girl and the miserable man and thinks that they do not deserve such a painful and miserable end. This result may lead to different inclinations on the part of different reader. One may love without prejudice and treat his beloved more emphatically. Another reader may think that there is no justice on earth; only he who is strong has the right to survive. Tess's reconciliation begins when she decides to kill Alec and reaches to climax when she has reunion with Angel. She is aware of her death, but she is happy. Ali Rıza Bey does not have a clear reconciliation; yet his return to Leyla and their partial reunion may be considered as reconciliation.

Bibliography

- Abrams, M.H. (1993) *A Glossary of Literary Terms*, Harcourt Brace & Company, Orlando, USA.
- Bennett, A. and Royle, N. (1999) *Introduction to Lit. Criticism and Theory*, Printice Hall, Bristol, UK.
- Butler, S.J. (1990) *Thomas Hardy* CUP, Cambridge
- Carey, G. (1996) *Notes on Tess of d'Uberilles* Cliff Notes Inc. Nebraska, USA.
- Dake, K. (1979) *Critical Approaches to Fiction of T.H.* The Macmillan Press. New York

- Scherrick, J. (1998) *An Annotated Bibliography* The Scarecrow Press. Inc. London
- Kramer, D. (1990) *Critical Essays on T.H. The Novels*, Hall&Co. Boston, USA.
- Kudret, C. (1998) *Türk Edebiyatında Hikaye ve Roman* (V.II) İnkilap yayınları İstanbul
- Moran, B. (2002) *Türk Romanına Eleştirel Bir Bakış*, (V.I.), İletişim Yayınları, İstanbul
- Ousby, I. *Companion To English Literature* CUP, Cambridge
- Pettit, P.C. (1994) *New Perspective on T.H.* Saint Martin Press, New York
- Sengupta, C. (1994) *The Novelist as Tragic Vision* Bahri Pub. Delhi
- Waldoff, L. (1998) *Thomas Hardy's Major Works* The Macmillan Press. Inc. New York